

# CrissCross

Volume 5 | Issue 1

Article 6

2017

# Industrial Education, Community Outreach, and Progressivism in Boston's North End 1880-1920

Meg Stanley Illinois Wesleyan University, mstanley@iwu.edu

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.iwu.edu/crisscross

Part of the Arts and Humanities Commons, Life Sciences Commons, Physical Sciences and Mathematics Commons, and the Social and Behavioral Sciences Commons

## **Recommended** Citation

Stanley, Meg (2017) "Industrial Education, Community Outreach, and Progressivism in Boston's North End 1880-1920," *CrissCross*: Vol. 5 : Iss. 1 , Article 6. Available at: https://digitalcommons.iwu.edu/crisscross/vol5/iss1/6

This Article is protected by copyright and/or related rights. It has been brought to you by Digital Commons @ IWU with permission from the rights-holder(s). You are free to use this material in any way that is permitted by the copyright and related rights legislation that applies to your use. For other uses you need to obtain permission from the rights-holder(s) directly, unless additional rights are indicated by a Creative Commons license in the record and/ or on the work itself. This material has been accepted for inclusion by editors of CrissCross at Illinois Wesleyan University. For more information, please contact digitalcommons@iwu.edu.

©Copyright is owned by the author of this document.

# Industrial Education, Community Outreach, and Progressivism in Boston's North End

1880-1920

Meg Stanley

History 490: Senior Seminar

April 25, 2017

#### **Responding to the Diversifying and Declining North End of Boston**

At the turn of the 20th century, America's Northeastern cities were expanding, diversifying and industrially progressing at an unprecedented rate. Immigrants from Eastern and Southern Europe were flocking to ethnic neighborhoods in search of familiarity in a new land. Boston's historic North End became an epicenter of ethnic collisions with a growing population of unskilled immigrants and a declining quality of life. Through the chaos, the North Bennet Street Industrial School (NBSIS) emerged as a leading educational institution. The school provided opportunities for education and community involvement, responding to the needs of the struggling neighborhood.

The Industrial School in its initial form was not able to respond to the needs of the community or address the progressive reforms that the founder, Mrs. Quincy Shaw, envisioned. Overtime, the North Bennet Street School transformed into one of America's first community centers. In this capacity, the institution carried out programs that better met Mrs. Shaw's progressive goal of impacting the lives of North End immigrants. *Progressivism* and *progressive reforms* are difficult terms to define, as Daniel Rodgers discusses in his article "In Search of Progressivism."<sup>1</sup> He searched for commonalities between progressive ideologies in order to better understand what made someone progressive. In some cases, progressives were similar in their impulse and motivation. Rodgers postulated that progressives typically responded to chaos and disorder with a results-driven mindset.<sup>2</sup> Progressives, after recognizing an issue or problem, were also similar in their intervention approaches: they focused on social efficiency, formed

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Daniel T. Rodgers, "In Search of Progressivism," *Reviews in American History* 10, no. 4 (1982): 114.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Ibid.

coalitions and fostered social bonds.<sup>3</sup> These commonalities align with the purpose and progression of the North Bennet Street Industrial School as it transformed into an innovative community center.

The North End of Boston transformed from a homogeneous Irish neighborhood into a poor, ethnically diverse community. This led to the frequent development of problems. Beginning in the 1860s, the Northeast became a destination for Southern and Eastern Europeans, and Boston's North End became the home for thousands of Italian immigrants settling into "ethnic enclaves."<sup>4</sup> The formerly Irish neighborhood transformed into a multi-ethnic community of unskilled laborers in cramped quarters. A large Jewish population found a niche in the North End, adding both Russian and German immigrants into the mix. Make-shift tenement living and trash-filled streets became the unfortunate norm of the North End.<sup>5</sup> Southern Europeans, especially Italians, experienced resentment and were subject to immigrant poverty and nativist exclusion.<sup>6</sup> Immigrants were divided by language and customs, yet united by their common discrimination and class experience. "Native-born" North Enders were startled by the changing environment along with thousands of Americans across the country.

The Progressive Era emerged directly in response to these changes. Between rapid industrialization and the influx of immigrants, cities transformed in a way that created uncertainty and disarray. In addition to issues of crowdedness and contamination, the depression

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Rodgers, "In Search of Progressivism," 125.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Augusto Ferraiuolo, "Boston's North End: Negotiating identity in an Italian American neighborhood," *Western Folklore*, 65 no. 3 (2006): 270.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> "Tenement Fad in Boston," New York Times, February 21, 1892: 9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Jon Smajda and Joseph Gerteis, "Ethnic Community and Ethnic Boundaries in a 'Sauce Scented Neighborhood," *Sociological Forum*, 27 no. 3: 620.

of the 1890s expedited the need for reform in America's cities.<sup>7</sup> Because of the rapid transformation of cities, unplanned development caused a variety of concerns for reformers.<sup>8</sup> The New York Times described Boston's North End as a notoriously poor, tenement-ridden neighborhood. The Times declared the neighborhood "beyond repair," with complications so extensive that charity efforts and money could not make an impact.<sup>9</sup> The author of The N.Y. Times article suggested demolition of the shabbily built tenements; at least then, the neighborhood would have a fresh start.<sup>10</sup> Progressive reformers chose, instead of burying the problem, to envision a new environment, and worked towards their ideal community. The chaos prevalent in the North End, similar to many other cities, gave rise to this results-driven, progressive agenda seeking control and order.

#### **Industrial Education: Opportunity and Control**

Progressives were pragmatic in their attempts to reshape American society; reformers looked at desired results and chose to intervene accordingly.<sup>11</sup> Pauline Agassiz Shaw, commonly referred to as Mrs. Quincy Shaw, founded the North Bennet Street Industrial School in 1880 in the heart of Boston's North End. Pauline's father was a Swiss naturalist and became a professor at Harvard University in 1850.<sup>12</sup> Mrs. Shaw felt a connection with the immigrants that flooded

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Josh Whiteclay Chambers II, *The Tyranny of Change: America in the Progressive Era, 1890-1920*, "The Progressive Impulse" (New York: St. Martin's Press, 2004): 155.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Chambers, "The Progressive Impulse," 155.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> "Tenement Fad in Boston," New York Times, 9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Rodgers, "In Search of Progressivism," 114.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Bonnie Hurd Smith, "Pauline Agassiz Shaw," *Boston Woman's Heritage Trail*, Accessed April 21, 2017, http://bwht.org/pauline-agassiz-shaw/

into Boston's North End, and like many wealthy Americans during this era, pursued a philanthropic cause as a means of intervention in her community.

Progressive Era philanthropy had a direct connection to the rapid change and industrial development in America's cities. Upper-class philanthropists were attempting to simultaneously act as benevolent, care-giving community leaders while also adding control to an unstable and hectic society.<sup>13</sup> Voluntary, cooperative effort was a cornerstone in the foundation of the progressive era.<sup>14</sup> Private reformers often re-envisioned their community and imagined a changed environment.<sup>15</sup> And like the government during this time, philanthropists sought oversight and regulation within their own communities.

Progressives, on a national scale, urged the federal government to intervene for positive changes in American society.<sup>16</sup> Josh Whiteclay Chambers II discussed how the government's role was intervention through legislative change; however, private reformers were responsible for the breadth and spread of progressivism.<sup>17</sup> In many ways, private reformers were better prepared to respond to the issues of their local communities. Their proximity to the working class people and their programs allowed for increased empathy and more opportunities for control and oversight.

The Shaw family chose industrial education as the primary avenue for their North End reform, as was common during the Progressive Era. In response to scientific management, the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Paul J. Ramsey, "Wrestling with Modernity: Philanthropy and the Children's Aid Society in Progressive-Era New York City," *New York History*, 88 no. 2: 155.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Chambers, "The Progressive Impulse," 151.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Rodgers, "In Search of Progressivism," 125.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Chambers, "The Progressive Impulse," 147.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Ibid.

nature of factory work, and the surplus of workers in large cities, philanthropists saw education as a route to give immigrants a ticket to stable work and better pay.<sup>18</sup> Student experiences in the first high schools in the US differed immensely. There were few regulations regarding curriculum, scheduling, and standards; localities and administrations had ample say and influence over the fate of their students.<sup>19</sup> Organization, management, and efficiency were major commonalities among progressives.<sup>20</sup> Mrs. Shaw created a curriculum combining traditional subjects and trade classes; she had complete oversight regarding the school and its enrollment.<sup>21</sup> In founding an industrial school, Mrs. Shaw was able to pursue a standardized, thorough educational experience for North End immigrants.

Industrial Education was seen as a productive, hands-on attempt at reform and regulation. In major cities across the United States, elite reformers with business contacts and ties with educational professionals began to implement progressive education reform, expanding the scope and nature of schooling. <sup>22</sup> One notable example was the Children's Aid Society, started in 1853, in Five Points District in New York City, a neighborhood ethnically and economically similar to that of the North End. <sup>23</sup> CAS founded an industrial school because it was more beneficial and controlled than "out-right alms giving."<sup>24</sup> The Children's Aid Society

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> David Angus and Jeffrey Mirel, *The Failed Promise of the American High School*, "Curriculum Expansion During the Progressive Era" (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999):19.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Rodgers, "In Search of Progressivism," 126.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> "Social Settlement Work," Journal of Education 71, no. 4 (1910): 98.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Angus and Mirel, *The Failed Promise*, "Curriculum Expansion During the Progressive Era," 18-19.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Ramsey, "Wrestling with Modernity," 153-154.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Ramsey, "Wrestling with Modernity," 153-154.

eased the transition for immigrants by providing a meaningful educational experience. This organization provided a replicable example for Mrs. Quincy Shaw when she began planning the North Bennet Street School.<sup>25</sup> Industrial Education was a form of philanthropic outreach in which Mrs. Shaw had total jurisdiction, could give constant input, and frequently witness the impact on their community.

Founders of vocational schools attempted to kill two birds with one stone. While industrial schools provided advancement opportunities for working class immigrants, the schools also responded to the emerging presence of idle children and youths in the streets. In the late 1800s, the concept of compulsory education was beginning to take shape, but for the most part, required education was not offered or mandated past the age of twelve.<sup>26</sup> Without required schooling, young teens were commonly taking up factory work or were left "idle" in the streets. Idleness in over-crowded, immigrant-heavy neighborhoods commonly led to disruption, crime, and an increase in filth.<sup>27</sup> Industrial Education was seen as a productive alternative to child labor and idleness; learning a trade was productive, and reducing the number of young teenagers in the streets would create a safer and cleaner community. In the North End specifically, ethnic disputes among young boys accounted for the majority of the crime.<sup>28</sup> While philanthropists, including Mrs. Shaw, sought to provide better opportunity and education for immigrants, vocational schools also provided a structured, organized alternative for youths.

<sup>28</sup> Ibid., 88.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> William Noyes, "Overwork, Idleness, or Industrial Education," *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social* Science 27, (1906): 87.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Ibid., 85-86.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Ibid.

#### **Education Extended: Vacation School and Continuation Classes**

Addressing the issue of idleness in immigrant youth was not fully solved by the high school's yearly enrollment. NBSIS was able to more thoroughly respond to idleness by extending its programs to out-of-school hours. The North Bennet Street Industrial School was one of the first institutions in the Northeast to provide "vacation school," what may now be considered summer school. In the summer of 1885, Mrs. Quincy Shaw instated a vacation school program that served over 250 immigrant children and youths per day, and served more than one thousand North Enders in a single season.<sup>29</sup> The North Bennet Street School's vacation school programs aligned with the basic purpose of industrial education. Classes included vocational subjects such as leather work and typing. More students were able to participate in vacation school than those enrolled in the high school, and high schoolers were able to continue their education year round.<sup>30</sup> The North Bennet Street Vacation School was considered an impactful and effective addition in providing organized alternatives for idle children by fellow educators in The Journal of Education.<sup>31</sup>

After the success of vacation school, the inclusion of "continuation classes" at NBSIS was another attempt at providing productive structure into the lives of North End immigrants. The North Bennet Street Industrial School offered continuation classes in vocational trades and domestic skills for working class adults after working hours.<sup>32</sup> Men were able to take skill specific classes while NBSIS offered women domesticity classes including cooking, upholstery,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Sadie American, "The Movement for Vacation Schools," American Journal of Sociology, 4 no. 3 (1898): 313.
<sup>30</sup> was at the state of the stat

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> "Social Settlement Work," *The Journal of Education*, 98.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> "Continuation Classes in Boston," The Journal of Education, 75 no. 10 (1912): 265-266.

and even English. The classes for women included "Americanization" focused curriculum. These classes aimed to assist the immigrant women in their transition to American life.

Americanization was a major theme among progressive philanthropists to urge assimilation, maintain control, and offer familiarity to working class immigrants.<sup>33</sup> English class was one of the most popular continuation classes offered at NBSIS.<sup>34</sup> Similarly, the domestic continuation classes offered at the School wished to teach American standards for cleanliness and proper home standards. The Journal of Education clearly stated that "Nothing will do more to better conditions in these districts than the creation of higher standards of home life."<sup>35</sup> These domesticity classes were set up to teach American values and norms while simultaneously pushing for stability and sanitation standards in the North End.

#### **Forming Effective Coalitions**

Continuation classes, in some cases, were employee-funded; therefore, these classes introduced a revolutionary concept and truly progressive opportunity for workers. One commonality among progressive ideologies was the push for social efficiency.<sup>36</sup> In many cases, coalitions were seen as the first step in forming an efficient society.<sup>37</sup> The emergence of employee-funded education created an efficient and impactful opportunity for both workers and employers. The Journal of Education wrote about the North Bennet Street School's evening

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Kate Clifford Larson, "The Saturday Evening Girls: A Progressive Era Library Club and the Intellectual Life of Working Class and Immigrant Girls in Turn-of-the-Century Boston," *The Library Quarterly: Information, Community, and Policy* 71 no. 2 (2001): 196.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> "Social Settlement Work," *The Journal of Education*, 98.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> "Continuation Classes in Boston," The Journal of Education, 265.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Rodgers, "In Search of Progressivism," 116, 123.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Rodgers, "In Search of Progressivism," 123.

programs as one of the most successful examples of continuation classes: "social betterment by means of such education shall increase efficiency and respect for labor."<sup>38</sup> This innovation fostered a relationship between employers, workers, and the community and was a large step forward in building effective coalitions.<sup>39</sup> The North Bennet Street Industrial School allowed workers to further their education while simultaneously understanding their need to earn wages. Continuation classes were a prime example of a socially efficient, progressive innovation in which an entirely new coalition mutually benefitted. Coalitions in the progressive era were considered key societal factions working together to mutually benefit from new reforms.<sup>40</sup>

Some historians argue that these coalitions were the key to progressive era success. Elizabeth Fones-Wolf researched Industrial Education and its impact on progressive coalitions.<sup>41</sup> She argued that industrial education was the binding concept between working class individuals, philanthropic reformers, and the up and coming trade unions.<sup>42</sup> Employers viewed this coalition as threatening and powerful; after this realization, manufacturers chose to show support for industrial education.<sup>43</sup> In the case of the North Bennet Street Industrial School, employers chose to fund their workers continued education instead of fighting the powerful coalition. Forming coalitions was an innovative way to put pressure on factory owners and corporations; it was an extremely efficient way to cause change for the working class.

<sup>41</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> "Social Settlement Work," Journal of Education, 98.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> "Continuation Classes in Boston," Journal of Education, 265-266.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Elizabeth Fones-Wolf, "The Politics of Vocationalism: Coalitions and Industrial Education in the Progressive Era," *The Historian*, 46 no. 1: 39.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Ibid., 39.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Fones-Wolf, "The Politics of Vocationalism," 39.

In addition to the vacation school and continuation classes, additional programs and activities were offered through NBSIS as it further resembled a community center over time. Mrs. Shaw worked to bring the ethnically diverse residents together through sponsoring clubs and hosting events. Mrs. Shaw imagined the school as a non-discriminatory building; she hoped that it would foster social bonds,<sup>44</sup> another commonality among progressive ideals.<sup>45</sup> The Journal of Education documented that the North Bennet Street Industrial School opened its doors to Italians, Russians, Jewish, and Irish immigrants.<sup>46</sup> There were books in over ten different languages included in the NBSIS library; reading clubs and English classes commonly brought the diverse immigrants into educational and social settings.<sup>47</sup> An onlooker into the Hancock School, a sister school of NBSIS, witnessed cooperation and friendship between a diverse group of immigrant students.<sup>48</sup>

The North Bennet Street School could possibly be one of the first community centers in the US. These centers were founded in response to the same changing urban environment that gave rise to industrial education. In every sense of the word, community centers were progressive institutions. Because schools were seen as "the central institution[s] holding residential areas together," the majority of American's first community centers were located

<sup>44</sup> Smith, "Pauline Agassiz Shaw," http://bwht.org/pauline-agassiz-shaw/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Rodgers, "In Search of Progressivism," 125.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> "A Boston North-End School," *The Journal of Education* 62, no. 7 (1905): 187-188.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Larson, "The Saturday Evening Girls," 198.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> "A Boston North-End School," *The Journal of Education*, 187.

within school walls.<sup>49</sup> Connecting communities and providing structure were the main reasons behind the community center movement; these motivations align directly with Rodgers' definition of progressive. Community centers were groundbreaking because they reached out to the working class. These centers provided access to education, leisure activities, and social events to the working class. These opportunities had been previously available to only the middle and upper classes. The founders of these centers, like Mrs. Shaw, chose to reach the working class because of the lack of order and organization prevalent in the lives of the poor. Rodgers stated that progressives took up "sympathy with what now seemed the innocent casualties of industrialization . . . and a keen desire for industrial peace and cooperation."<sup>50</sup> Community centers provided a controlled space to serve and cooperate with working class immigrants; the building itself made this new relationship, or coalition, possible.

When the NBSIS began functioning as a community center, it paved the way to strengthen community bonds. Daniel Rodgers stated that progressive programs had an "emphasis on social bonds and the nature of human beings," and Mrs. Shaw provided the space for clubs, conversation, and the creation of relationships.<sup>51</sup> The Saturday Evening Girls Club was an example of a sponsored club that united the community. The group originated as a library club meeting every Saturday at NBSIS.<sup>52</sup> This club utilized the resources at the school to print a social newspaper. The goal of the paper was to inform and entertain the working class women of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Ronald M Johnson, "Black and White Apart: The Community Center in the District of Columbia, 1915-1930," *Records of the Columbia Historical Society, Washington, D.C.* 52, 1989: 12.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Rodgers, "In Search of Progressivism," 125.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup>Rodgers, "In Search of Progressivism," 125.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Larson, "The Saturday Evening Girls," 197.

13

the North End.<sup>53</sup> This Saturday Evening Girls News, a publication run entirely by Jewish women, provided leadership roles and the development of printing skills for its members.<sup>54</sup> In choosing to sponsor this club, Mrs. Shaw extended her progressive agenda by fostering community relationships. This club allowed for the development of new social connections between and within immigrant groups while also educating female workers about the printing and writing process. The women included an obituary for Mrs. Shaw in the April, 1917 edition of the publication thank her for the supporting their cause and for her undeniable impact in the North End community.<sup>55</sup>

By supporting these clubs and activities, Mrs. Shaw again attempted to control and suppress the ethnic tensions in the North End. After the influx of Southern and Eastern Europeans in the 1870s and 1880s, distaste for Italian immigrants spread through the Irish enclaves in the community. Italians were, in many cases, not considered American, but instead described as intruders and imports.<sup>56</sup> Irish North Enders often blamed the Italians for the living conditions, crowded spaces, and lack of work opportunities.<sup>57</sup> Racial tension crept into the workplace and the streets of the North End. Progressive initiatives commonly sought to prevent entropy and discord in the rapidly changing cities.<sup>58</sup> The Hebrew Industrial School (HIS), a separate institution located near NBSIS, worked to alleviate tensions between Russian and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Georgie C. Greener, "Mrs. Quincy A Shaw: A Tribute," Saturday Evening Girls News 5, no. 6 (1917):7-8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> May Emery Hall, "The Transformation of Boston's North End," *The New England Magazine* 40 (1909): 457-458.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> May Emery Hall, "The Transformation of Boston's North End," *The New England Magazine* 40 (1909): 457-458.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> William Foote Whyte, "Race Conflicts in the North End of Boston," *The New England Quarterly* 12, no. 4 (1939): 624.

German Jews.<sup>59</sup> While HIS worked to form social bonds within the Jewish community, it unfortunately excluded other immigrants, which added to the ethnic strains in the neighborhood.<sup>60</sup> Alleviating these ethnic tensions connected the two progressive ideals of implementing organization and the formation of social bonds lessens the prevalence of violence and conflict, which NBSIS was able to do, while the Hebrew Industrial School did not.

#### **Progressive Reforms Invite Criticism**

The backlash to the Hebrew Industrial School shows how most every progressive reform developed opposition and criticism. Not everyone was pleased with Mrs. Shaw and the vast array of programs that NBSIS offered. Dr. Rocco Brindisi, the president of the Boston Dante Alighieri Society, was extremely opposed to the work of NBSIS. The Dante Alighieri Society was a group of Italian men hoping to preserve the Italian culture and reputation in America. <sup>61</sup> Brindisi disapproved of how NBSIS portrayed the North End in its 1913 Annual report. Brindisi believed that the North Bennet Street Industrial School blamed the issues in the North End on the arrival of Italian immigrants. He was critical of the institution as a whole; he claimed that NBSIS was constantly highlighting the problems of his beloved neighborhood.<sup>62</sup> His criticism highlights the "divided legacy" of many progressive reforms. <sup>63</sup> Looking back on the North Bennet Street

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Jacob Neusner, "The Impact of Immigration and Philanthropy upon the Boston Jewish Community," *Publications of the American Jewish Historical Society* 46, No. 2, 1956: 73.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> Neusner, "The Impact of Immigration and Philanthropy upon the Boston Jewish Community," 73.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Dr. Rocco Brindisi, "Cleaned North End of Thugs: Dr. Brindisi Replies to 'Insults' of Reformers," *Boston Post* (1914): 13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> Brindisi, "Cleaned North End of Thugs," 13

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> Chambers, "The Progressive Impulse," 157.

School, a divided legacy implies two polemic views regarding the institution's impact in the North End and at large.

Progressive reformers sought to find a pragmatic solution to societal problems. In order to do so, progressives vocalized concerns and drew attention to social and political issues. NBSIS publicly proclaimed in each Annual report that the North End neighborhood was in desperate need of help. Daniel Rodgers indicated that almost no one agreed during the Progressive era.<sup>64</sup> Social reform visions rarely aligned with each other. In many cases these visions were in direct opposition with each other.<sup>65</sup> Dr. Brindisi admitted that the North End was evolving and changing, yet he did not believe the changes had negative repercussions. While the Journal of Education believed that The Social Service House provided a safe social space for struggling workers, providing meals when needed, Brindisi saw the program as condescending to immigrants.<sup>66</sup> Although the North End needed relief and reform, as with any progressive outreach, there was disagreement in how best to respond.

### The Journal of Education and its Progressive Agenda

As cited throughout this paper, the majority of primary sources that include reports on the North Bennet Street School came from the supportive Journal of Education. The Journal praised NBSIS as the best charitable institution of its type in the Boston area;<sup>67</sup> however, the focus of this praise was for the community outreach programs, not the school itself. In many cases, this journal seemed to propagandize NBSIS; the writers constantly displayed shock and admiration of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> Rodgers, "In Search of Progressivism," 118.

<sup>65</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> Brindisi, "Cleaned North End of Thugs," 13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> "Continuation Classes in Boston," The Journal of Education, 265.

the success of the institution. In one article, an unidentified visitor spent a day at the Hancock School, The North Bennet Street School's sister school. The Journal of Education said the school was "a revolution;" one could not find a brighter set of students.<sup>68</sup> The Journal detailed the success of these institutions to push its own progressive agenda, without regard for the truth of the details. Educators remembered Alfred Winship, the founder of the journal, as a progressive who worked towards the "future of education." Winship pushed for industrial education as a means of providing stability for immigrants, as well as uplifting the community.<sup>69</sup> In his obituary, the author made clear that The Journal of Education would continue to push for the ideals and spirit of Winship.<sup>70</sup>

#### **The Progressive Impulse: Intention Matters**

Because The Journal of Education was the primary source documenting the impact of NBSIS, and it had a clear bias toward the NBSIS model, it is difficult to determine the true impact of the school and its programs. Yet intentions and motivation were commonly what connected progressive reformers. Results were not what made the North Bennet Street School and its affiliated programs progressive. Josh Whiteclay Chambers II wrote in *The Tyranny of Change* that the trend connecting reformers during this period was a "progressive impulse."<sup>71</sup> Chambers discussed progressives in terms of their goals. He commonly wrote that "progressives sought" to make a number of changes. In their vision and impetus, reformers could be labeled as

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> "A Boston North End School," *The Journal of Education*, 187.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> "They Remember Winship," The Journal of Education 129, no. 2 (1945): 47-51.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> Chambers, "The Progressive Impulse," 132.

progressives. Mrs. Quincy Shaw is the prime example of a Bostonian immigrant who had an *impulse* to respond and make a difference in her community.

Although Chambers defined the progressive agenda in slightly different terms and categories than Rodgers, he much more clearly discussed ideology and intention. Teddy Roosevelt, a leader in progressive politics, declared that "[The Progressive] cause is based on the eternal principles of righteousness; and even though we who now lead may for the time fail, in the end the cause itself shall triumph . . ."<sup>72</sup> Roosevelt blatantly stated that results, impact and influence were not imperative to the progressive ideology. The "cause," purpose and intention of reformers, such as those defined by Rodgers, refined the definition of progressive.

The progressive nature of the North Bennet Street Industrial School, then, returns to Mrs. Quincy Shaw. While one cannot fully understand Hull House, one of the most famous progressive institutions, without researching Jane Addams, one cannot consider the North Bennet Street Industrial School separately from its founder. Mrs. Shaw, an immigrant herself, was passionate about immigrants and the transition to American life and culture.<sup>73</sup> She chose to be active and responsive about the issues overwhelming her neighborhood. In addition to the North Bennet Street Industrial School, Mrs. Shaw founded preschool and kindergarten classrooms. Many regarded these as her largest accomplishment; these kindergartens were soon integrated into the Boston Public School system.<sup>74</sup> Mrs. Shaw's *impact* on the Boston community may have been measurable and significant, yet the results are not what defined Mrs. Shaw as a progressive.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> Chambers, "The Progressive Impulse," 132.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> Smith, "Pauline Agassiz Shaw," http://bwht.org/pauline-agassiz-shaw/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> Smith, "Pauline Agassiz Shaw," http://bwht.org/pauline-agassiz-shaw/.

The North Bennet Street School's community-centered programs provide the best cumulative example of Mrs. Shaw's progressive intentions and ideals.

Mrs. Quincy Shaw founded the North Bennet Street Industrial School as a vocational high school; yet to be a truly progressive institution, Mrs. Shaw expanded the programs and opened her school to the community. The publications that expressed support for the school focused primarily on the continuation classes, Social Service House, and community outreach programs separate from the high school. Through these innovative efforts, Mrs. Shaw channeled multiple progressive ideals: providing control, fostering social efficiency and building social bonds. Mrs. Shaw was a results-driven philanthropist who created an institution with an undeniable presence in the North End of Boston. Although NBSIS and its affiliated programs were, at least marginally, impactful on the community, the progressive effect of Mrs. Shaw's work was rooted in her ideology and vision for the North End. After modifying the industrial school by opening it for community programs, Mrs. Shaw and the North Bennet Street Industrial School, without doubt, could be defined as progressive.

#### Bibliography

American, Sadie. "The Movement for Vacation Schools," *American Journal of Sociology* 4 no. 3 (1898): 309-325.

Angus, David and Jeffrey Mirel. *The Failed Promise of the American High School*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1999.

"A Boston North-End School." The Journal of Education 62, no. 7 (1905): 187-188.

- Brindisi, Dr. Rocco. "Cleaned North End of Thugs: Dr. Brindisi Replies to 'Insults' of Reformers." *Boston Post* (1914).
- Chambers II, Josh Whiteclay. *The Tyranny of Change: America in the Progressive Era, 1890-1920.* New York: St. Martin's Press, 2004.
- Ferraiuolo, Augusto. "Boston's North End: Negotiating identity in an Italian American neighborhood." *Western Folklore* 65 no. 3 (2006).
- Fones-Wolf, Elizabeth. "The Politics of Vocationalism: Coalitions and Industrial Education in the Progressive Era." *The Historian* 46 no. 1: 39-55.
- Greener, Georgie C. "Mrs. Quincy A Shaw: A Tribute" Saturday Evening Girls News 5, no. 6 (1917).
- Hall, Mary Emery. "The Transformation of Boston's North End." *The New England Magazine* 40 (1909): 457-463.
- Johnson, Ronald M. "Black and White Apart: The Community Center in the District of Columbia, 1915-1930." *Records of the Columbia Historical Society, Washington, D.C.* 52, 1989: 12-28.
- Larson, Kate Clifford. "The Saturday Evening Girls: A Progressive Era Library Club and the Intellectual Life of Working Class and Immigrant Girls in Turn-of-the-Century Boston" *The Library Quarterly: Information, Community, and Policy* 71 no. 2 (2001): 195-230.
- Neusner, Jacob. "The Impact of Immigration and Philanthropy upon the Boston Jewish Community." *Publications of the American Jewish Historical Society* 46, No. 2, 1956: 71-85.
- Noyes, William. "Overwork, Idleness, or Industrial Education." *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social* Science 27, (1906): 84-95.
- Ramsey, Paul J. "Wrestling with Modernity: Philanthropy and the Children's Aid Society in Progressive-Era New York City." *New York History* 88, no. 2 (2007): 155.
- Rodgers, Daniel T. "In Search of Progressivism." *Reviews in American History* 10, no. 4 (1982): 113-132.
- Smajda, Jon and Joseph Gerteis. "Ethnic Community and Ethnic Boundaries in a 'Sauce Scented Neighborhood."" *Sociological Forum* 27 no. 3 (2012): 617-640.

- Smith, Bonnie Hurd. "Pauline Agassiz Shaw." *Boston Woman's Heritage Trail*. Accessed April 21, 2017. http://bwht.org/pauline-agassiz-shaw/.
- "Social Settlement Work." Journal of Education 71, no. 4 (1910): 98-100.
- "Tenement Fad in Boston." New York Times (New York, New York), February 21, 1892.
- "They Remember Winship." The Journal of Education 129, no. 2 (1945): 47-51.
- Whyte, William Foote. "Race Conflicts in the North End of Boston." *The New England Quarterly* 12, no. 4 (1939): 623-642.