Hume, Blackburn, and Korsgaard on the Sensible Knave

Bill Porter
Illinois Wesleyan University

Charlotte Brown, Faculty Advisor
Illinois Wesleyan University

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.iwu.edu/jwprc

https://digitalcommons.iwu.edu/jwprc/2005/oralpres4/1

This is protected by copyright and/or related rights. It has been brought to you by Digital Commons @ IWU with permission from the rights-holder(s). You are free to use this material in any way that is permitted by the copyright and related rights legislation that applies to your use. For other uses you need to obtain permission from the rights-holder(s) directly, unless additional rights are indicated by a Creative Commons license in the record and/or on the work itself. This material has been accepted for inclusion by faculty at Illinois Wesleyan University. For more information, please contact digitalcommons@iwu.edu.
©Copyright is owned by the author of this document.
HUME, BLACKBURN, AND KORSGAARD ON THE SENSIBLE KNAVE

Bill Porter and Charlotte Brown*
Philosophy Department, Illinois Wesleyan University

In "Ruling Passions," Simon Blackburn advances an ethical theory that welds Blackburn's quasi-realism to a Humean-Smithian theory of moral sentiments. This paper concerns the latter Humean side of Blackburn's theory, specifically Blackburn's treatment of Hume's famous problem of the sensible knave.

I have two tasks. My first task is to examine Hume's original formulation of, and reply to, the problem posed by the sensible knave. Also, I will deal with two complexities in Hume's picture: a prima facie circularity problem, and the threat posed by a variation or descendant of the original sensible knave.

My more ambitious second task is an examination of the knave-related contemporary controversy between Blackburn and Christine Korsgaard. Blackburn's Humean defense consists especially in his repudiation of criticism levelled against Humean theories by Korsgaard in "The Sources of Normativity." I hope to show that Blackburn fails to escape Korsgaard's argument that Humean theories generally fail, in the case of the knave, to fulfill a requirement of transparency.