1995

Performance Practice: Issues of Authentic Performance

Catherine Webb '97

Illinois Wesleyan University

Recommended Citation
Available at: http://digitalcommons.iwu.edu/rev/vol8/iss1/10
Performance Practice: Issues of Authentic Performance

Catherine Webb
Since the turn of the twentieth century, there has been an increased interest in performing music as it was originally heard. Empirically speaking, this idea of an “authentic performance” refers to a performance that adheres as strictly as possible to the original intentions of the composer. As scholars in the field of performance practice have discovered, however, discerning what a composer had in mind for a given piece is virtually impossible. Even in twentieth-century music, with composers such as Gustav Mahler who left little room in a score for questions concerning interpretation, certain elements deter performances from being truly “authentic.” Ensemble size, acoustical variance in performance settings, and the temperament of individual performers on a given day may contribute to a deviation from what the composer had in mind. If these difficulties arise when dealing with music from this century, the problems associated with establishing guidelines for authentic performance of Renaissance music must be even greater; this music dates from a time before printing became widespread, when there were no recordings on which to base an interpretation of a given piece, and when composers were generally part of the performing ensemble.

Authenticity, then, becomes a question of relativity rather than purity, making authentic performances possible only in a general sense. Through analysis of general performance techniques and performance settings of a musical era, one can gain a general idea of how pieces from that era should be performed in modern situations. Text underlay (the way in which text is set to music) and application of musica ficta (implied accidentals) as applied to Renaissance vocal music are examples of common issues associated with authentic performance.

The problem of setting text with music is not new to performers of this century. Performers of the fifteenth century also dealt with the complexities of text underlay; music would often place all of the text at the end of a phrase rather than setting each syllable to a note. This practice occurred for several reasons, the main one (paper was not to be wasted), but perhaps the most important reason for this disregard of specific text setting is given the text during the fifteenth century did not consider the text as they wrote; the specific underlay was left to scribes. The early discussion of how to set the text dates from the sixteenth century and declares that “there is no logic in melody beyond [that in] the mind of him who composes it.” In other words, Renaissance scribes, as well as composers, were given a rather free rein when placing the text to the music.

There are several guidelines for modern performers when attempting to set text to fifteenth-century music. Guidelines are based on treatises that actually existed in the sixteenth century, but can generally be applied to performance of the sixteenth century as well. Giovanni Lanfranco (La prattica della musica eclettica, 1533), Gioseffo Zarlino (Le istitutione harmoniche, 1558), and Gaspar Stoquerus (De musica verbali libri quattuor, 1563) all discuss how to set the text for both choirs and composers in the most effective way possible:

1. Long notes receive long syllables and should be grouped with longer ones and the unaccented syllables.
2. The first note of a piece and the final note should receive a syllable.
3. The final note should receive the same syllable.
4. Ligatures receive only one syllable.
of the twentieth century, there has been an
performing music as it was originally heard.
This idea of an “authentic performance” refers
adheres as strictly as possible to the original
composer. As scholars in the field of performance
studied, however, discerning what a composer had
intended is virtually impossible. Even in twentieth-
century composers such as Gustav Mahler who left little
instructions concerning interpretation, certain ele-
ments of performance are left to the performers on a given day
may contribute to a performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be truly “authentic.” Ensemble
work in performance settings, and the tempera-
ture of a given day may contribute to a
performance that may not be true

One of the complexities of text underlay; the scribe copying the
music would often place all of the text at the beginning of a musical
phrase rather than setting each syllable to a corresponding note.¹
This practice occurred for several reasons, including economical
ones (paper was not to be wasted),² but perhaps the most logical
reason for this disregard of specific text setting is the lack of empha-
sis given the text during the fifteenth century. Composers probably
did not consider the text as they wrote; the task of assigning any
specific underlay was left to scribes. The earliest known theoretical
discussion of how to set the text dates from the mid-fifteenth cen-
tury and declares that “there is no logic in how to adjust words to a
melody beyond [that in] the mind of him who has to notate it.”³
In other words, Renaissance scribes, as well as modern editors, were
given a rather free rein when placing the text under the music.

There are several guidelines for modern performers to fol-
low when attempting to set text to fifteenth-century music. These
guidelines are based on treatises that actually originated in the six-
teenth century, but can generally be applied to music of the fif-
teenth century as well. Giovanni Lanfranco (Scintelle di musica,
1533), Gioseffo Zarlino (Le istitutione harmoniche, 1558), and
Gaspar Stoquerus (De musica verbali libri duo, c. 1570)⁴ instructed
both choirs and composers in the most effective ways to align text
with music properly:⁵

1. Long notes receive long syllables; shorter notes should be
   grouped with longer ones and therefore should receive
   unaccented syllables.
2. The first note of a piece and the first note after a rest
   should receive a syllable.
3. The final note should receive the final syllable.
4. Ligatures receive only one syllable on the first note.
Although there are some exceptions to this rule, generally when the last note of a phrase is a member of a ligature, the final syllable is assigned to the first note of the ligature.

5. If there are more syllables than notes the notes must be subdivided.

6. Dotted notes generally should not be subdivided.

7. Repeated notes on the same pitch must receive individual syllables.

8. If there are many notes left at the end of a phrase, the last note is assigned to the last syllable, and the remainder are sung with the last unaccented syllable.

9. In passages with a long-short-long (♩♩♩) rhythm, the short note does not receive a syllable, nor does the long note following it unless there are not enough notes to fit the text. In this case, all three notes are assigned syllables.

Still, it is extremely difficult to infer how fifteenth-century composers felt their texts should be set. Though applying the above guidelines retroactively may lead to a generally accurate performance of Renaissance literature, performers must be careful to consider variations in geographic location and varying conventions of Latin pronunciation throughout western Europe. Every choir across the continent may have had a unique style of performance, and every composer had a different scribe with his own style of setting text. It is easy to see how a single “authentic” performance becomes nearly impossible, even with established guidelines.

The emergence of sixteenth-century composers such as Josquin Desprez and Adrian Willaert (Willaert was especially influential in the sixteenth-century circle of theorists; his opinions form the basis for the three aforementioned treatises) led to the compositional style common to the rhythmically and texturally unified, lending textural clarity. Text underlay in early sixteenth-century music becomes much more specific, since composers are more direct in their notation of underlay. Editors are free to move beyond how the text was reflected in the music underlay in early sixteenth-century music.

Another problem with performance of early modern music is the application of musica ficta. Every period requires an understanding of when and how the musica ficta was applied; unfortunately, the guidelines in the middle ages were vague. Up through the end of the Renaissance period, there are no simple solutions to the problem of how the text was reflected in the music, and there are no simple solutions to the problem of how the text was reflected in the music. Spataro expressed his frustration with musica ficta in a letter to Pietro Aaron written in 1524.

"...the musician or composer is obligated, in order that the singer may sing the text as it was never intended by the composer, to sometimes apply musica ficta, and also to sometimes apply musica reservata, a style of music which is characterized by the ability to move beyond how the text was reflected in the music within the melodic line."

As with text underlay in early sixteenth-century music, there are no simple solutions to the problem of how the text was reflected in the music, and there are no simple solutions to the problem of how the text was reflected in the music.
there are some exceptions to this rule, general
the last note of a phrase is a member of a ligature
the basis for the three aforementioned treatises?) lead to a lessening
of the ambiguous treatment of the text setting. Music of the so-
called *ars perfecta* (literally meaning, “perfect art,” this term refers
to the compositional style common to the late 1400s) tended to be
rhythmically and texturally unified, lending itself easily to greater
textural clarity. Text underlay in early sixteenth-century music
becomes much more specific, since composers and scribes were
more direct in their notation of underlay. Consequently, modern
editors are free to move beyond how the text was set and can exa-
in how the text was reflected in the music using the common prac-
tices of *musica reservata*, a style of music that strived to display the
meaning of the text within the melodic lines.

Another problem with performance practice of Renaissance
music is the application of *musica ficta*. Editing music from this
period requires an understanding of when and how accidentals were
applied; unfortunately, the guidelines in this instance are more
vague. Up through the end of the Renaissance era, it was not con-
sidered necessary to notate accidentals; the assumption was that
singers would apply *ficta* where necessary. Whether application of
accidentals was completely at the discretion of the performers is
unclear, but this possibility is supported by the fact that some acci-
dentals were not notated. As with text underlay, every choir may
well have had its own rules for the application of *ficta*. Once again,
there are no simple solutions to the problem of how to resolve *ficta*
for Renaissance performers or modern editors. In fact, Giovanni
Spataro expressed his frustration with *ficta* and its applications in a
letter to Pietro Aaron written in 1524:

the musician or composer is obliged to indicate his inten-
tion, in order that the singer may not chance to do some-
thing that was never intended by the composer. . . . The
singer is not to be expected, on first reading, to sing the proper notes in the places where this sign \[ \_ \_ \_ \_ \] may occur, inasmuch as it may belong there, or may not belong there. 9

Though there were no uniform rules for the application of accidentals, theorists have defined two basic reasons for applying musica ficta. The first general application of ficta is said to be causa pulchritudinis ("because of beauty"), 10 and is seen frequently with the emergence of cadence points in the late fifteenth century. The second, causa necessitatis (or "because of necessity"), 11 arose from the Renaissance concern for consonance and dissonance. Ficta was applied out of necessity to prevent mi and fa from sounding simultaneously, resulting in a diminished octave or fifth. 12 Unfortunately, even this avoidance of tritone cannot be thought of as gospel truth; Zarlino expressed his concern with nonharmonic cross-relations of imperfect octaves and fifths in the sixteenth century, implying that such dissonance was common practice during the late Renaissance. 13

The complexities involved in unearthing performing techniques of just these two aspects of Renaissance vocal music are seemingly endless, and text underlay and musica ficta are only the surface of the issue. While the difficulties involved with this type of research might seem to outweigh the benefits of an authentic performance, they should not be viewed negatively. Instead, scholars and performers alike should view the field of performance practice as a way of transcending history. By coming as close as possible to the composer’s original intent, modern performers may empathize with the performers of four hundred years ago. Modern musicians can better appreciate and respect the musicians of the past as we learn to play the lute or organ from tablature and sing works with contrasting mensuration or unwritten applications of musica ficta.
to be expected, on first reading, to sing the
in the places where this sign [ ] may occur,
it may belong there, or may not belong there.9
were no uniform rules for the application of
have defined two basic reasons for applying
rst general application of ficta is said to be
(“because of beauty”),10 and is seen frequently
of cadence points in the late fifteenth century.
necessitas (or “because of necessity”),11 arose
concern for consonance and dissonance.
out of necessity to prevent mi and fa from
usly, resulting in a diminished octave or fifth.12
this avoidance of tritone cannot be thought of
ino expressed his concern with nonharmonic
perfect octaves and fifths in the sixteenth centu-

dissonance was common practice during the
encies involved in unearthing performing tech-
two aspects of Renaissance vocal music are
and text underlay and musica ficta are only the
While the difficulties involved with this type of
to outweigh the benefits of an authentic per-
ld not be viewed negatively. Instead, scholars
should view the field of performance practice
ling history. By coming as close as possible to
al intent, modern performers may empathize
of four hundred years ago. Modern musicians
and respect the musicians of the past as we
on or unwritten applications of musica ficta.

Empirical authenticity may not be possible with the amount of
research that has been done thus far, but relative authenticity is an
asset to modern performance of Renaissance music. Until genuine-
ly authentic performances become possible, musicians should con-
tinue to use the resources available and strive to realize the compos-
er’s original intent.
Notes


2 Ibid.


7 Ibid. 149.

8 Ibid. 107.


11 Ibid.

12 Ibid.

13 Ibid. 115.

Works Cited


Notes

1 John-Paul Christopher Jackson, Performing Renaissance Music (London, 1986), 51.


dance Practice: Music Before 1600, 114.

Works Cited


